



PENNSYLVANIA ORNITHOLOGICAL RECORDS COMMITTEE  
210 Welcome Ave. Norwood, PA 19074

8 February 2001

Mark McConaughy  
P. O. Box 486  
Harrison City, PA 15636-0468

Dear Mark,

Thank you for submitting documentation on the Trumpeter Swan at Wildwood Lake in July 1997, the Thayer's Gull at the Mcville Hawk Watch on 25 October 1998, and the European Goldfinch at Port Taverton in July 1997. After careful review, the committee regrets that it cannot accept the swan and the gull as formal record.

The swan and the goldfinch were placed in Class 5: "The record is correct, but the bird represents an escapee or an introduced species not established in Pennsylvania."

On the gull, five members voted against acceptance mainly because they felt that the bird was more likely a Kumlien's Gull, considering the light mantle. A third- or fourth-winter Thayer's would be as dark gray as -- or even slightly darker than -- a Herring Gull. The members also thought that Thayer's identification requires more time for careful study and a closer observation to separate it conclusively from Kumlien's or a Thayer's x Kumlien's intergrade.

The committee emphasizes that non-acceptance does not mean that the bird was not the species reported, but rather that the committee believes the documentation submitted does not support the identification conclusively. We hope that this will not discourage you from submitting documentation on any rarities you may find in the future.

Finally, the committee apologizes for the unacceptably long delay before all members were able to vote on the record. Circumstances beyond our control caused the problem, and we believe that we are back on a timely track.

Sincerely,

For the Committee:  
Paul Hess, Chairman

P.S. Beginning this year observers will receive postcards acknowledging that the committee has received their documentation. In addition, whereas observers formerly were notified only when reports were not accepted (in disappointing or irritating letters like this one), they will now receive cards announcing that their records *have* been accepted.

Records #105-01-1997, #348-02-1998, #892-01-1997

892-01-1997

European Goldfinch *Carduelis carduelis*

A European Goldfinch was reported by Mrs. Marion Maneri to the Central Pennsylvania Birdline on 6 July 1997. The bird was visiting her finch feeder filled with a finch feed (mixed Niger, canary seed and cracked sunflower seeds). The Maneri's live at 638 Silver Creek Road, Port Traverton in Snyder County, Pennsylvania. I went up to see this bird on 12 July 1997 and was successful at viewing it. I have enclosed a copy of a short videotape and a couple slides depicting the bird for review by the PORC committee. I am reasonably certain this bird is an escapee and expect it to be so noted. However, it should be documented in case it appears elsewhere.

The bird appears to be a Goldfinch (Clement, Harris and Davis, 1993, Finches and Sparrows: an Identification Guide, pg, 42-43, 240-242) or European Goldfinch (Peterson 4th edition Field Guide to the Birds of Eastern North America). However, there is one notable difference between the birds illustrated in these guides and the one visiting the Mianeri's. I suspect the difference may be one developed in domestic or caged versus wild European Goldfinches.

The bird visiting Maneri's is at least 1/2" to 3/4" larger than American Goldfinches visiting the same feeder and displays an aggressive nature. Mrs. Maneri described its aggressive behavior toward American Goldfinches, and I observed it trying to chase American Grldfinches (with varying degrees of success) off the feeder when it wanted to eat. The bill is thicker and heavier than that of the American Goldfinch, almost like a Grosbeak bill in shape and size vis a vis the face of the bird. The bird has black lores sunrounded by a red forehead and cheek area. The red extends back to the eye. The crown of the head going back to the nape of the neck is black. The area of the ear coverlets between the black crown and nape and red forehead and cheek is white. Behind the black nape section and also probably considered part of the nape, was a second white band around the back of the neck. This feature is different from field guide illustrations which have a yellowish-brown back of the neck and mantle immediately behind the black nape. The bird does have a yellowish-brown mantle and back. The breast and belly were white and separated from each other by an incomplete yellowish-brown band (i.e., it did not join at the middle of the breast/belly, but only extended out toward that area). The wing was largely black with yellow greater coverlets and portions of the primaries and secondaries. There also were some white spots on the ends of some of the prinarys. The rump was pale and the tail was black with some white spots on the ends of the tailfeathers.

I did hear it call a couple of times. The best I can describe it is that it is somewhat bubbly in nature and decidedly different from the American GoldFinch calls. Let me know if you have any questions about these birds or descriptions. Sincerely yours,

Mark A. McConanghy  
5373A Manayunk Road  
Haarrsbrg, PA 17109 (717) 783-2665

# Pennsylvania Ornithological Records Committee

## Voting Tabulation - Round One

Species: European Goldfinch (*Carduelis carduelis*)

Date of Sighting: 6 July 1997 to 12 July 1997

Location: PORT TAVERTON

County: SNYDER

Observer(s): Mark McConaughy, Marion Maneri

Date of Submission: 1997

Submitted by: Mark McConaughy, Marion Maneri

WRITTEN DESCRIPTION YES PHOTO YES SPECIMEN NO RECORDING VIDEO

Member	Class I	Class II	Class III	Class IV-A				Abstain
					Class IV-B	Class IV-C	Class V	
D. Couchman							X	
T. Floyd								X
P. Hess							X	
R. Ickes							X	
J. McWilliams							X	
B. Reid							X	<del>X</del>
P. Rodewald							X	
TOTALS							6	1
DECISION								

Comments: 0/6/1

Signature (Secretary):

Date

9/18/00